beyond the terms of reference of the Finance Commission ? Is there any special reference made that loans are to be waived in Punjab ? Is there any special reference made to the Tenth Finance Commission to consider things outside the purview of the terms of reference of the Finance Commission ? As I understand it, probably, this is not happening.

SHRI MANMOHAN SINGH : The terms of reference of the Tenth Finance Commission include consideration of the debt problems of all States including Punjab. In any case, the Finance Commission is competent to look into any matter which it considers important.

श्री महेश्वर सिंह: उपसभापति महोदया, क्या मंत्री महोदय इस बात से अवगत हैं कि थर्मल परियोजना से जो बिजली उत्पादन होता है उसकी तुलना में जल विद्युत परियोजना से जो उत्पादन होता है उसमें खर्चा कम आता है ? तो मैं माननीय मंत्री महोदय से जानना चाहूंगा कि क्या सरकार भविष्य में थर्मल परियोजना की तुलना में जल विद्युत परियोजनाओं को ज्यादा प्राथमिकता देगी ? उदाहरण के लिए हिमाचल प्रदेश में ....

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : It does not relate to the question. It is very specific to Punjab. (*Interruptions*) ... So, you may ask the other Minister, not this Minister.

श्री महेश्वर सिंह: पंजाब से ही बता रहा हूं । थर्मल से जो बिजली पैदा होता है वह ..... (**व्यवधान**) हिमाचल प्रदेश पंजाब से मिला हुआ है । ..... (**व्यवधान**)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : You ask the Power Minister. Question No. 263.

IMPACT OF STAPPING OF POWER SUPPLY TO SEBS BY NTPC

*263. DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI :

DR. NAUNIHAL SINGH :

Will the Minister of POWER be pleased to refer to the answer to Unstarred Questions 582 nd 586 given in the Rajya Sabha on 7th December, 1993, respectively and state :

(a) what could be the possible ramifications of NTPC's decision of stopping power supply to SEBs on the ultimate consumers of electricity; and

(b) in what manner and to what extent the NTPC has been adversely affected by the non-payment of dues by the SEBs, the details thereof ?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF POWER (SHRI P. V. RANGAYYA NAIDU) : (a) and (b) A Statement is laid on the Table of the House.

(a) and (b) The functioning of the National Thermal Power Corporation (NTPC) as well as its investment programme has been adversely affected due to non-payment of dues by the State Electricity Boards (SEBs). A statement of dues is annexed (*See* below). It has resulted in reduced availability of internal resources for capital schemes as also in increasing the cost of working capital since NTPC has to consequently resort to commercial borrowings to meet its working capital requirement. The adverse receivables position of NTPC may also affect the disbursement of multilateral assistance to the NTPC. In this background, NTPC has to regulate power supply commensurate with payment to SEBs' to the extent technically feasible. This would ensure that NTPC is run on commercial lines and also provide an impetus to the SEBs to do likewise. Even though restricting supplies would cause hardship to consumers, NTPC was left with no other alternative. Continuance of this situation would have totally jeopardised the functioning of NTPC, affecting its generation and future expansion which would, in turn, have affected consumers even more in the long run.

*The question was actually asked on the floor of the Home by Dr. Na unihal Singh.

ANNEXURE

NTPC S outstanding dues as on 30th November, 1993

(Rs. Lacs)

State/Electricity Boards	Outstanding as on date	Surcharge billed	Total outstanding
1	2	3	4
A. Northern Region & National Capital Region :			
Uttar Pradesh	35061	23100	58161
Rajasthan	9898	10967	20865
D.E.S.U.	19246	5867	25113
Punjab	5008	174	5182
Haryana	29031	9618	38649
Himachal Pradesh	698	715	1413
Jammu & Kashmir	14567	1616	16183
U.T. of Chandigarh	66	24	90
TOTAL (A)	113575	52081	165656
B. Western Region :			
Madhya Pradesh	3512	15899	19411
Maharashtra	5452	6451	11903
Gujarat	8621	5988	14609
Goa	—47	4	—43
Dadar & Nagar Haveli	—15	14	— 1
Daman & Diu	—6	0	—6
TOTAL (B)	17517	28356	45873
C. Southern Region :			
Andhra Pradesh	8894	2718	11612
Karnataka	1800	2300	4100
Tamil Nadu	9367	4240	13607
Kerala	1566	1775	3341
Goa	74	0	74
Pondicherry	—42	2	— 40
TOTAL (C)	21659	11035	32694

1	2	3	4
D. Eastern Region			
West Bengal	2139	4864	7003
Bihar	25970	18153	44123
Orissa	2295	2152	4447
D.V.C.	8872	6850	15722
Sikkim	25	6	31
TOTAL (D) :	39301	32025	71326
TOTAL (A) + (B) + (C) + (D) . .	192052	123497	315549

DR. NAUNIHAL SINGH : Madam, the reply given by the hon. Minister appears to be very unsatisfactory and it is nothing but a face-saving device. I think now the Government is determined to do arm-twisting of the State Governments. I would like to know from the hon. Minister whether the Central Government has deducted a substantial amount of funds from the Plan assistance of at least 10 States to meet their arrears to Central agencies, like the NTPC, Coal India Ltd. and Damodar Valley Corporation. If so, which are those States ? I would also like to know how much amount has been deducted from each State.

SHRI P. V. RANGAYYA NAIDU : Madam, the Government of India arranged to recover an amount of Rs. 1020 crores from the Central Plan Assistance towards the arrears accumulated on 31st May, 1990 in four annual instalments. Out of this amount, Rs. 1018 crores have already been recovered and the remaining Rs. 2 crores are yet to be received. These orders pertain to the high level dues for 18 SEBs the major portion of which pertains to the UPSEB, Rajasthan SEB, Haryana SEB, MP SEB and Bihar SEB where the dues exceeded Rs. 50 crores. The Government of India again arranged to recover an amount of Rs. 745.31 crores in four instalments towards arrear accumulated as on 31st May, 1992. These dues are accumulated in just 24 months in respect of 9 SEBs, namely, UP, Haryana, J&K, Madhya Pradesh, Gujarat, Tamil Nadu, Kerala, West Bengal and Bihar. Out of this amount, Rs. 244.9 crores has already been recovered and the remaining Rs. 500 crores are yet to be received.

DR. NAUNIHAL SINGH : Madam, the Minister has not answered my question. My question was : How much amount has been deducted from the Plan assistance, which is given to States, in each case where the SEBs have defaulted ? Anyway, I go ahead with my second supplementary. I would like to know from the hon. Minister if the State Electricity Boards were to clear their current bills regularly what would have been achieved by the NTPC in terms of generation of power every year and improvement of the commercial viability in view of the external assistance from the World Bank and the Asian Development Bank.

THE MINISTER OF POWER (SHRI N.K.P. SALVE) : Madam it is in the view of business prudence and commercial foresight that we have to recover dues from our consumers. In fact, the non-recovery of dues, if you were to see, aggregates to Rs. 1,135 crores. We have to borrow money for our working capital. We have to borrow money for the purpose of capital investment. If for the power that we generate and sell, money is not paid to us, I think one day we will have to close down the NTPC. I protest vehemently against the word used

by the hon. Member. He is a very responsible Member. He said, "We are doing arm-twisting". If we want to recover the money that is due to us, is it arm-twisting? He said, "Any commercial venture which can run on its own without recovering for goods it sells and services it supplies.." Therefore, it is my respectful submission in humility but firmly that we are bent on recovering what is due in respect of power which we sell.

SHRI SANGH PRIYA GAUTAM : I would like to know from the hon. Minister whether it is a fact that the NTPC has closed down one of the units in the Power Gas Project, Gujarat to stop supply to Gujarat State Electricity Board for non-payment of energy bills.

SHRI P. V. RANGAYYA NAIDU : Madam, there is no doubt that we have issued a notice to the Gujarat Government that power supply will be discontinued if they do not pay up arrears. Subsequently, on the basis of a mutual agreement, the Gujarat Government has paid some part of the arrears. So the power supply was continued.

SHRI E. BALANANDAN : Madam, this is a very serious issue. The State Governments are following a policy to supply current at subsidised rates to the peasantry and small consumers. Now all of a sudden the Government of India demands from the State Governments to pay up all the arrears. If that is not done, the Government will discontinue the power supply. That is the attitude. How do you think a country like India will survive ? You had a policy earlier and on the basis of that policy all the State Governments in the country operated. By that policy you were helping the peasantry by supplying power at low cost. You were supplying power at a cost which was less than the production cost. Therefore, almost all the Electricity Boards are in the red. One fine morning the Central Government wakes up and demands that all its dues should be paid immediately; otherwise, power supply will be cut. This method, I must submit, is absolutely wrong. When you change the policy, you have to look into the details and frame such a policy so that the system works. Now the system is being changed. I want the Central Government to reconsider this policy and discuss it with the State Governments and frame a new policy by which both the Centre as well as the States benefit. I want a specific reply. The Government should review the policy and see that the State Electricity Boards are not affected. You should see that the needs of the States are also met while you insist on payment.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE : Madam, firstly, as a fact, it has to be stated that this was not done all of a sudden. We had been continuously issuing notices to various State Electricity Boards who were defaulting persistently.. ..*(interruptions)*.. ..

SHRI E. BALANANDAN : That is the first point.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE : You said that we woke up suddenly. We did not wake up suddenly....*(Interruptions)*....

SHRI E. BALANANDAN : You woke up late...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE : Better late than never. We have nothing to say. If the States want to supply cheap power to the peasantry or the farmers or to anybody else, it is for them to decide. So far as we are concerned, we have a commitment to the nation. We have to generate a certain quantum of power. We need to have ...*(interruptions)*....

SHRI E. BALANANDAN : Which nation are you talking of ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Balanandan, let him answer.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE : Is there any unparliamentary word that I have used ? I am talking, Madam, in humility but with a certain degree of firmness because this is one matter in which we are not going to yield. We need money. I have

submitted that we are not going to sit in judgement over the States for the concessions they want to give. It is for them to decide. So long as the State Electricity Boards are buying power from us, we have to generate power and we cannot generate power without money. We need funds for our working capital. We need money for our capital expenditure. Where is that to come from ? Therefore, I want to submit respectfully to the hon. Member that after consideration of the matter and reconsideration of the matter we have decided that we are going to take coercive measures to recover dues from our customers.

श्री राम नरेश यादव : महोदया, यह बात सही है जो माननीय मंत्री जी ने कहा कि हम बिजली बेचते हैं और बेचने के आधार पर जो बकाया है उसे वसूल करना भी जरूरी है । जहां तक उत्तर प्रदेश का सवाल है इस पर पांच अरब रुपये से अधिक बकाया है और टोटल पूरे देश में जितने राज्य विद्युत बोर्ड हैं उन पर 31 अरब रुपये बकाया है । क्योंकि किसानों का मामला है, आप भी बकाया धमकी देकर बिजली काटने की कार्रवाई शुरू कर देंगे और स्टेट भी करेगा, इससे किसान प्रभावित होगा और जब वह प्रभावित होगा तो आपका अन्न भी प्रभावित होगा । जब अन्न प्रभावित होगा तो जो देश का आर्थिक ढांचा है उस पर बहुत बुरा असर पड़ेगा । इसको ध्यान में रखते हुए मैं यह जानना चाहता हूं कि जो पांच अरब रुपये हमारे उत्तर प्रदेश पर बकाया है, जैसा आपने बताया, तो यह कब से कब तक का बकाया है और इस बीच में आपकी तरफ से इसे वसूल करने के लिए क्या कार्रवाई हुई ? साथ ही साथ भविष्य में आप क्या उत्तर प्रदेश की सरकार के बिजली मंत्री या मुख्य मंत्री से बैठकर इस विषय पर वार्ता करेंगे, कोई हल ढूंढ निकालने का प्रयास करेंगे ? यदि नहीं करेंगे तो क्यों नहीं ? यह बहुत ही महत्वपूर्ण प्रश्न है और किसानों से तथा दूसरे लोगों से जुड़ा हुआ है।

श्री एच. के. दो. साल्वे : महोदया, मैं माननीय सदस्य से आग्रहपूर्वक यह निवेदन करना चाहता हूं कि हमने जो जवाब दिया है उसमें बताया है कि 30 नवम्बर 1993 को 581.61 करोड़ रुपया उत्तर प्रदेश स्टेट इलेक्ट्रीसिटी बोर्ड से बाकी है । हमें इस बात की खुशी नहीं है कि राज्यों के जो बिजली बोर्ड्स हैं उनको पावर की कटौती हो । हम तो अपने कंज्यूमर्स को खुश रखना चाहते हैं । मगर 581 करोड़ रुपया जिनसे ड्यू है..... (व्यवधान) । हम तो उनको खुश रखना चाहते हैं । उनसे पैसा लेकर खुश रखना चाहते हैं। मैं बताता हूं कि एक दफा बिजली काट दी तो पैसा वसूल भी हो जाता है, हुआ है । हमें इस रास्ते से जाना बिलकुल पसंद नहीं है । मगर यह पैसा वसूल किये बिना हम बिजली का निर्माण नहीं कर पाएंगे । इस सवाल का क्या जवाब है ? हमारा भी उत्तरदायित्व है । हमें अपना वर्किंग केपिटल चाहिए, हमें अपने केपिटल एक्सपेंडिचर के लिए पैसा चाहिए । वह कहां से आएगा ? डा. मनमोहन सिंह पैसा नहीं देते, एलैक्ट्रीसिटी बोर्ड पैसा नहीं देते तो हवा से बिजली पैदा होने वाली नहीं है । इस मामले में हमें सदन की सहानुभूति चाहिए। इसलिए हमारे पब्लिक सेक्टर अन्डरटेकिंग्ज अच्छा काम कर रही हैं । ऊर्जा मंत्री के मातहत हैं । वे क्या सिक हो जायें और बी. आई. एफ. आर. में चले जायें ? उनका पैसा वसूल नहीं होगा तो वे बिजली का उत्पादन नहीं कर पाएंगे। यह स्थिति बड़ी गंभीर है । इसलिए मेरा निवेदन है कि एक दफा नहीं, पच्चीस दफा हम मुख्य मंत्रियों के साथ बैठकर बात करने के लिए तैयार हैं, हम गवर्नरों के साथ बैठकर बात करने के लिए तैयार हैं, हम स्टेट इलेक्ट्रीसिटी बोर्ड के साथ, उनके चेयरमैन के साथ बैठकर बात करने के लिए तैयार हैं । वे आकर चर्चा करें और हमें बतायें कि वे किस तरीके से हमारा पैसा देना चाहते हैं । हम सुविधा देने के लिए तैयार हैं। मगर नियत तो साफ हो । जैसा बालानन्दन साहब ने कहा कि यह कैसे हो सकता है, वे कहां से दे सकते हैं, इसका किसानों पर असर पड़ेगा । असर पड़ेगा तो जरूर, लेकिन हमारे पर इसका उल्टा असर पड़ रहा है। मुल्क में अगर बिजली पैदा नहीं हो पाएगी तो कैसे हो पाएगा । इसलिए मेरा बाग्रदब निवेदन है कि आप कृपया अपने मुख्य मंत्रियों से कहिये कि वे अपने स्टेट इलेक्ट्रीसिटी बोर्डों से कहें कि वे हम से चर्चा करें, बात करें कि कैसे इसको लिक्विड करना चाहते हैं। उनका जो बकाया है उसके बारे में बात करें । उनसे हम हर तरीके से अपना सहयोग देने के लिए तैयार हैं।

SHRI ASHOK MITRA : Madam, I have listened with great attention to the Power Minister's peroration. He says that he wants money. He has to raise money. Now, will he use this money to pay 16 per cent subsidy in foreign exchange to the foreign power plant owners ?

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE : Madam, is this relevant ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : No, it is not relevant... (*Interruptions*). That question is not relevant.

SHRI ASHOK MITRA : He has no answer.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : You have to ask relevant questions, questions related to the subject, on the floor of the House.

श्री सुरेश पचौरी: महोदया अधिकांश राज्य बिजली बोर्ड्स घाटे में चल रहे हैं और उनके द्वारा बकाया राशि का भुगतान न करने की वजह से एन.पी.पी.सी. के कार्यक्रमों पर भी प्रतिकूल प्रभाव पड़ रहा है । मंत्री जी ने बताया कि उन्होंने राज्य बिजली बोर्डों को निर्देश दिये हैं। जिन बिजली बोर्डों ने उनके निर्देशों का परिपालन नहीं किया वैसे कितने बिजली बोर्ड्स हैं और उनके ऊपर क्या कार्यवाही की गई है ? साथ ही जो सरचार्ज बिल है 12497 लाख रुपयों का उसके संबंध में क्या केन्द्रीय सरकार इस बात का विचार कर रही है कि सरचार्ज केन्द्रीय सरकार की ओर से माफ किया जाए ? यदि हां तो उसका ब्यौरा क्या है ? साथ ही मैं मध्य प्रदेश... (**व्यवधान**)

उपसभापति: आप जरा छोटा सवाल पूछिये । I have to pass on to another question.

श्री सुरेश पचौरी: महोदया यह मध्य प्रदेश से संबंधित है । मध्य प्रदेश की सरकार ने यह फैसला लिया है कि पांच हार्स पावर तक की बिजली मुफ्त में दी जाएगी । इसके लिए केन्द्रीय सरकार की तरफ से उन्हें क्या मदद दी जाएगी यह मैं जानना चाहता हूं।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : That does not come because he is not manufacturing that Bijli.

आप फर्स्ट पार्ट का जवाब दे दीजिये ।

SHRI P. V. RANGAYYA NAIDU : We have issued notices to five State Governments, namely, Bihar, Haryana, West Bengal, Gujarat and Orissa. Regarding his second question as to whether the Government or the NTPC will waive the surcharge if the state Governments pays the principal amount—I can assure the Member that each case will be considered on merit and if we can make use of his good offices with the Governments to settle the dues, I will definitely go more than half way to help the State.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now, Shri Viren J. Shah.... (*interruptions*).. I have twenty questioners.

SHRI VIREN J. SHAH : Madam, I appreciate that a need is there for the National Thermal Power Corporation or for any other organisation to have funds for their activities. We, the Council of States, are here representing the States. While answering the first question, the hon. Finance Minister has said that the States must manage their affairs on their own. May I enquire from the hon. Power Minister, keeping in view the autonomy of the States, whether the Government have thought of any schemes to help the States to improve their finances, particularly those of the Electricity Boards because the impact of this is going to be on the total national economy and the Central Government would also be affected by this, by the non-functioning of the SEBs ? I want to know whether the Government of India have formulated any scheme or plan to help or advise the State Governments to improve their efficiency and be in a position to meet the funds requirement or the bills of the NTPC and also to continue their economic activities.

SHRI P. V. RANGAYYA NAIDU : Madam Chairperson, a meeting of the State Electricity Ministers was held in the month of January, 1993. During this meeting, certain decisions were arrived at and an Action Plan was drawn up which *inter alia* would help the State Electricity Boards to overcome their financial difficulties. If State Governments implement the suggestions sincerely, I am sure most of the State Electricity Boards will be able to overcome their difficulties.

SHRI VIREN J. SHAH : Is there any monitoring mechanism ?

SHRI P. V. RANGAYYA NAIDU : Yes, we are monitoring. In fact, I myself had held a review meeting of all the Electricity Boards in the country.. (*interruptions*)...

SHRI E. BALANANDAN : That is all right. But the earlier policy has changed.. (*interruptions*)..

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Balanandan, I think this is Question Hour.

SHRI P. V. RANGAYYA NAIDU : Madam Chairperson, regarding monitoring I myself had held a review meeting of all the electricity boards in the country in the month of October, 1993 to see what extent the Action Plan has been implemented and we have sent letters on the basis of this review to the State Electricity Boards requesting them to take further steps to see that the functioning of the Electricity Boards is improved during the current financial year itself.

SHRI JOHN F. FERNANDES : Madam, most of the Electricity Boards in the country are in the red because they are mismanaged and power is underutilised and there is pilferage. I think the hon. Minister is on record saying that the power system in the country should be privatised. I think it is by the end of this century.. (*interruptions*).. May I know from the hon. Minister whether there are any requests received from private parties in this regard so that it can be better managed ? If there is any scheme before the Government, I want to know by when it will be implemented.. (*interruptions*)..

SHRI P. V. RANGAYYA NAIDU : Madam, do you want me to answer this question ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I don't know. I did not know what he asked.

SHRI JOHN F. FERNANDES : Madam, it was because of interruptions. I will repeat my question.

Most of the Electricity Boards in our country are in the red because they are mismanaged.. (*Interruptions*)..

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : He is answering.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE : Madam, our privatisation programme is only to supplement the existing generating capacity and not to supplant the same. We have absolutely no plans for privatising the State Electricity Boards.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now we will move to the next question.. (*interruptions*)... Question No. 264 ... (*interruptions*)..We have already discussed it at length.

INDUSTRIALISTS OPPOSITION TO GOSWAMI COMMITTEE REPORT

*264. SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY :

SHRI CHIMANBHAI MEHTA† :

Will the Minister of FINANCE be pleased to state :

(a) whether it is a fact that industrialists have opposed the Goswami Committee report on sick industries;

@Previously Starred Question No. 204 transferred from 16-12-93.

†The question was actually asked on the floor of the House by Shri Chimanbhai Mehta.